

STAFF REPORT

DATE **December 18, 2018**
PLACE **MICHAEL B COLEMAN GOVERNMENT CENTER**
TIME **111 NORTH FRONT STREET, ROOM 203**
3:00 PM

A CALL TO ORDER

B APPROVAL OF MINUTES

~3:00 MEETING SUMMARY – November 20, 2018

C OLD BUSINESS - APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROVAL

~3:05 1. APPLICATION: **EF_18-06-004**
ADDRESS: 617 W STATE ST
PROPERTY OWNER: UNITED PREPARATORY ACADEMY, INC
APPLICANT: NATHAN GAMMELLA
TO BE REVIEWED: NEW ADDITION- PREVIOUSLY APPROVED WITH CONDITIONS

Sub-Districts: **West Broad St** **Arts and Innovation**

Dodge Park

Code Reference: **3323.21 – EF Development Standards**

Staff Observations:

United Preparatory Academy occupies an existing school building located at 617 W State in the Dodge Park sub-district. The applicant is requesting to construct an addition to the school to house a multi-purpose space, storage area, and kitchen. The application was reviewed and approved by the Board in July 2018, with the condition the applicant return for review of the exterior materials, building details, landscaping and graphics (if applicable). A parking reduction was approved by the Board at the July 2018 regular meeting. The applicant came to the EFRB in November 2018 and the application was tabled.

The updated submittal includes updated exterior materials, elevations, and landscaping.

Applicable Code Development Standards:

Architecture—Mixed-Use, Commercial, Multifamily and institutional buildings	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A wide range of architectural styles are appropriate for East Franklinton, with preference for contemporary building design and materials. 	The building architecture is appropriate for the proposed new/expanded use, and is appropriate for its location in the neighborhood.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Building frontages that exceed 50 feet in width should consider using vertical piers or other vertical elements, spaced at intervals of 15 feet to 30 feet along the entire building elevation. 	Due to the nature of the multi-purpose space, staff supports the proposed elevations.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Street-level facades are recommended to be as transparent as possible to create an attractive pedestrian environment, except for residential spaces on ground floors. For a primary façade, at least 60 percent of the first-floor wall area (between two feet and ten feet) should be clear/non-tinted window glass, which permits a view of the building's interior to a minimum depth of four feet. At least 25 percent of upper-floor wall areas should be clear/non-tinted window glass. 	Due to the nature of the multi-purpose space, staff supports the proposed elevations.
Landscaping	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Landscape materials and design should enhance structures, create and define public and private spaces, and provide shade, aesthetic appeal, and environmental benefits. 	Consistent
Street Trees and Streetscape	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Tree-lined residential and commercial streets should be either established or maintained. 	Staff recommends street trees be planted evenly along Chapel.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Landscaping on private property bordering sidewalks should be designed with new elements, such as a new plant form or material, at a scale and intervals appropriate to the site. This is not intended to discourage a uniform street tree or landscape theme, but to add interest to the streetscape and enhance the pedestrian experience. 	Consistent
Landscape Material	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> All trees (including street trees) should meet the following minimum size at the time of planting: shade trees 2 inches caliper; ornamental trees 1 1/2 inches caliper; and evergreen trees five feet in height. Tree caliper is measured six inches from the ground. 	Applicant to coordinate with city forester for tree species and size selection.

The proposal is generally consistent with the recommendations of the East Franklinton Creative Community District Plan and allows for the expansion of an existing school. Staff supports the proposal due to the nature of the new use (multi-purpose room/gymnasium). Staff recommends approval with the condition that trees are provided on the west elevation and additional trees are planted evenly in the ROW along the West Chapel St. to establish a full tree line. Tree selection to be coordinated with city forester.

Staff Recommendation:

Approval

Approval with Conditions

Table

Disapproval

1. Trees along west elevation and evenly distributed within W Chapel ROW
2. Applicant coordinates street tree selection with city forester

~3:20 2. APPLICATION: EF_18-03-001
 ADDRESS: 548 W STATE ST
 PROPERTY OWNER: 548 WEST STATE STREET, LLC
 APPLICANT: OXIDE REAL ESTATE DEVELOPMENT (SHAWN KICHLINE)
 TO BE REVIEWED: MIXED USE DEVELOPMENT- PREVIOUSLY APPROVED WITH CONDITIONS

Sub-Districts: West Broad St Arts and Innovation **Dodge Park**
 Code Reference: 3323.21 – EF Development Standards
 3312 - Parking

Staff Observations:

548 W State was previously approved as a mixed use development consisting of 12 residential units and a restaurant within the Dodge Park sub-district. The application was heard and approved with conditions at the September 2018 EFRB meeting. The approval included a side yard setback modification and parking reduction from 26 to 0 spaces. The Council Variance to allow an eating and drinking establishment was approved by City Council on June 7, 2018.

The applicant is returning to the Board to request approval of a lighting and landscaping plan, to request a modification to allow 0 on-site shade trees, an additional parking reduction, and a bicycle parking reduction. The previously approved parking reduction was based on smaller footprint for the eating and drinking establishment and the applicant has increased the size of the restaurant to 1497 sq. ft. as permitted by the Council Variance and supported by the EFRB. The bicycle parking reduction request allows the applicant to provide interior bicycle parking in lieu of exterior bicycle parking.

The applicant is requesting to reduce the number of parking spaces from 33 to 0, and the number of bicycle parking spaces from 4 to 0 with the intention of providing 4 spaces in the ROW if approved by the Department of Public Service.

Applicable Code Development Standards:

Standard	Dodge Park District	Staff Comments
Parking	Restaurant: 18 Residential: 15	0 on-site spaces 7 shared spaces
Bicycle Parking	2 spaces – Residential 2 spaces - Restaurant	0 on-site spaces 12 interior spaces 4 right-of-way spaces

Applicable Plan Development Standards:

Parking reductions may be appropriate for higher density, mixed use projects. Shared parking arrangements may be appropriate.	Consistent. The applicant is providing bicycle parking and shared parking.
Lights should have fully shielded, recessed lamps directed downward to prevent glare and shine above the horizontal plane.	Staff recommends downward facing lights for the building elevations.

The proposal is generally consistent with the recommendations of the East Franklinton Creative Community District Plan. Lighting on the building is recommended to be downward facing per the plan's recommendation. Staff supports the request to reduce the number of shade trees on-site as the applicant will provide two shade trees in the right-of-way. Staff supports the request to reduce the number of parking spaces from 33 to 0 as it allows the applicant to provide a restaurant use that aligns with the Board supported Council Variance. Staff also supports the request to reduce bicycle parking to 0 spaces with the condition interior bicycle parking is provided. Staff recommends approval with conditions. (Note: Any items within the public right-of-way require approval by the Department of Public Service.)

If approved, the Board will grant the following modifications to the East Franklinton District Development Standards:

1. To permit a parking reduction from 33 spaces to 0 spaces
2. To permit a bicycle parking reduction from 4 to 0 spaces
3. To permit a shade tree reduction (on-site) from 2 to 0 trees

Previously approved modifications to the East Franklinton District Development Standards include:

4. To reduce a side yard setback from 3' to 0'
5. To permit a parking reduction from 26 spaces to 0 spaces

Staff Recommendation:

Approval

Approval with Conditions

Table

Disapproval

1. Street tree selection to be coordinated with city forester
2. Lighting on building elevation are directed downward
3. Interior bicycle parking is provided
4. A shared parking agreement for 7 residential parking spaces is recommended

D APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROVAL**~3:40**

3. APPLICATION: **EF_18-11-001**
ADDRESS: 463 W TOWN ST
PROPERTY OWNER: BREWDOG FRANKLINTON LLC
APPLICANT: NANCY RADKE/ PR SIGNS
TO BE REVIEWED: GRAPHIC

Sub-Districts: West Broad St**Arts and Innovation****Dodge Park****Code Reference:** 3375 - Graphics**Staff Observations:**

Brewdog Franklinton LLC received approval for two signs and wall murals at the June 20, 2017 regular meeting. The applicant is requesting to replace one (1) externally illuminated painted wall sign with one (1) internally illuminated wall sign. The new proposed sign is approximately 8' x 10', which is slightly smaller than the existing sign.

Applicable Graphic Design Guidelines:

Recommendation and Standard	Staff Comments
General Guidelines	
Signs that reinforce the creativity, craftsmanship, and industrial character of the East Franklinton District are encouraged.	Consistent
Signage should be pedestrian in orientation and scale. Wall and blade signs are preferred. Auto-oriented signage is not appropriate for this district. The Review Board may consider auto-oriented signage requests featuring unique and artistic elements if such graphics are integral to the design of a building, development, and/or character of the sub-districts.	Consistent
New signage should be designed to be a logical and complementary component of the overall design of a storefront and/or the associated building's architecture.	Consistent
The Review Board may consider internally illuminated graphics if such graphics are integral to the design of a building or development. Internally illuminated box sign cabinets are not appropriate.	For Board consideration
Wall Signs - Building	
The width of building wall signs should not exceed 50 percent of the width of the structure.	Consistent

The proposal is generally consistent with the recommendations of the East Franklinton Creative Community District Plan and Graphic Design Guidelines. Staff supports the proposed sign as it is a complimentary component to the overall design of the building's architecture. The Graphic Design Guidelines state the Review Board may consider internally illuminated graphics if such graphics are integral to the design of a building or development.

Staff Recommendation:**Approval**

Approval with Conditions

Table

Disapproval

~3:50

4. APPLICATION: EF_18-12-001
ADDRESS: 463 W TOWN ST
PROPERTY OWNER: BREWDog- USA
APPLICANT: DAVID KEYSER- DKB ARCHITECTS
TO BE REVIEWED: EXTERIOR MODIFICATIONS- COVERED PATIOS

Sub-Districts: West Broad St **Arts and Innovation** Dodge Park

Code Reference: 3323.21 DEVELOPMENT STANDARDS

Staff Observations:

BrewDog occupies an existing building located at 463 W. Town St. in the Arts and Innovation sub-district. The applicant is requesting to construct a covered patio for a portion of the existing ground floor patio area, and a covered roof terrace for a portion of the existing roof terrace. The proposed design will use the existing steel columns to construct a steel structure and corrugated steel roof that will connect to the existing building. The roof terrace will be partially covered with a metal operable louver system, as well as seasonal canvas membrane "sail."

The submittal includes a site plan, building plans, building elevations, and photos.

Applicable Code Development Standards:

Standard	Art and Innovation District	Staff Comments
Maximum Bldg Height	5 stories or 60'	Consistent

Applicable Plan Development Standards:

Recommendation and Standard	Staff Comments
Architecture—Mixed-Use, Commercial, Multifamily and institutional buildings	
<ul style="list-style-type: none">Architecture should be provided that establishes and defines a building's appeal and enhances the industrial character of East Franklinton.	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none">A wide range of architectural styles are appropriate for East Franklinton, with preference for contemporary building design and materials.	Consistent

The proposal is consistent with the recommendations of the East Franklinton Creative Community District Plan and applicable Code Development Standards. Staff recommends approval.

Staff Recommendation:

Approval

Approval with Conditions

Table

Disapproval

~4:00

5. APPLICATION: EF_18-12-005
ADDRESS: 40 N GRUBB ST
PROPERTY OWNER: C.O.M.E. JESUS
APPLICANT: WOODBRIDGE CUSTOM BUILDERS
TO BE REVIEWED: WINDOW REPLACEMENT

Sub-Districts: West Broad St **Arts and Innovation** Dodge Park

Code Reference: 3323.21 – EF Development Standards
3375 - Graphics

Staff Observations:

C.O.M.E. Jesus occupies an existing commercial building and is seeking to replace the existing vinyl windows, which are 25 years old, with like vinyl double hung windows. Given the building's age and architecture, it contributes to the historic building stock of East Franklinton. Staff recommends that the applicant use a window product from the Historic Preservation Office Approved Composite, Fiberglass, and Aluminum Clad Wood Window List to preserve the historic integrity of the building and return appropriate dimensions to the window openings. Historic preservation staff specifically recommends The Lincoln standard double-hung or insert aluminum clad window, the Trimline Eclipse EC300 aluminum clad window, or a window from the Marvin manufacturer.

Historic and other contributing buildings should be preserved to the extent possible and if necessary, incorporated into new development.	Staff recommends windows appropriate for historical structure.
---	--

The applicant is requesting Board approval to allow the use of vinyl windows (as submitted) instead of staff recommended windows.

Staff Recommendation: Approval **Approval with Conditions** Table Disapproval

1. Applicant to use a window product from the Historic Preservation Office Approved Composite, Fiberglass, and Aluminum Clad Wood Window List

E APPLICATIONS FOR CONCEPTUAL REVIEW**~4:15**

6. APPLICATION: **EF_18-12-003**
 ADDRESS: 79, 83-85 MCDOWELL ST
 PROPERTY OWNER: CITY OF COLUMBUS
 APPLICANT: COLUMBUS HOUSING PARTNERSHIP, INC (HOMEPORT)
 TO BE REVIEWED: DEMOLITION
 NEW CONSTRUCTION

Sub-Districts: **West Broad St** Arts and Innovation Dodge Park
3323.19 – Land Use
3323.21 – EF Development Standards
 Code Reference: **3321 – General Site Development Standards**
3312 – Off-Street Parking and Loading

Staff Observations:

The Columbus Housing Partnership (Homeport) is proposing to construct a four-story, multi-family development at the corner of State and McDowell within the West Broad Street sub district. The units will be intended for families earning 80% AMI or below, and the project is anticipated to be submitted to OHFA as a 2019 tax credit application. The development includes a mix of one, two and three-bedroom units, for a total of 52 units, and a total of 64 parking spaces – 4 onsite spaces and 60 spaces in the Gravity II parking garage.

The site is currently owned by the City of Columbus Land Redevelopment Division (Land Bank) and is occupied by a historic church structure. The church was built in 1911 and has been vacant for approximately seven years. The applicant is requesting approval to demolish the existing church structure in order to construct the multi-family development.

Demolition Permit Review:

Standard	Staff Comments
Replacement use reviewed and approved by EFRB	Applicant is proposing a 4 story, multi-family development with 50-52 units.
Is the property eligible for Columbus or National Registers of Historic Places?	Yes, the structure is of historic significance.

Applicable Code Land Use Standard:

Standard	West Broad Sub-District	Staff Comments
4 + dwelling unit building	Permitted Use	Consistent

Applicable Code Development Standards:

Parking, stacking, circulation	Not permitted between the principle building and right-of-way	Consistent
Parking	52 units * 1.5 spaces = 78	64 spaces provided - 4 onsite and 60 shared spaces (Gravity II) 14 Space Reduction
Bicycle Parking	6 spaces required	TBD

Overall, the proposal is consistent with the East Franklinton Creative Community District Plan.

Staff supports the request for demolition of a historically significant structure based on the following factors: 1. the existing condition of the structure and significant cost burden for restoration; 2. the use of the site to provide affordable housing in the East Franklinton District; 3. A design that is appropriate for the site; 4. EFRB condition of approval – award of public financing through tax credits or other financing for the project; 5. EFRB condition of approval – documentation of historic structure by cultural resource consultant – to be coordinated with Historic Preservation Office.

Staff supports the overall proposal, including the request to reduce the number of parking spaces to 64 and to allow parking on a separate lot than the primary use. Staff notes that bicycle parking is required for the site. Additional information has been requested for the north and west elevations and material samples are recommended. Staff does not support using stamped brick panels as an option for the brick material shown. Street trees are recommended along both State and McDowell. Staff recommends larger glass relief on upper stories to relate to the dimensions of the standard windows on the building or to appear more as a “glass block” with minimal window seams. Staff anticipates being in support of the project and recommending approval with conditions at the January 2019 meeting.

F OTHER BUSINESS

~4:45 1. ELECTION OF VICE-CHAIR

G STAFF APPROVED APPLICATIONS ISSUED CERTIFICATES OF APPROVAL

		APPROVED : ITEMS APPROVED	COA ISSUED
1.	EF_18-12-002 401 WEST RICH STREET	12/6/2018: Tenant Sign	12/6/2018
2.	EF_18-12-003 401 WEST RICH STREET	12/7/2018: Parking Sign	12/7/2018

H NEXT MEETING

**TUESDAY – JANUARY 15, 2019 AT 3:00 PM
MICHAEL B COLEMAN GOVERNMENT CENTER
111 NORTH FRONT STREET, ROOM 203**